



CITY OF WESTMINSTER

MINUTES

Planning (Major Applications) Sub-Committee

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

Minutes of a meeting of the **Planning (Major Applications) Sub-Committee** held on **Tuesday 11th February, 2020**, Rooms 18.01 & 18.03, 18th Floor, 64 Victoria Street, London, SW1E 6QP.

Members Present: Councillors Robert Rigby (Chairman), Eoghain Murphy, James Spencer, Jim Glen, David Boothroyd and Geoff Barraclough.

Also Present: Councillors Mark Shearer and David Harvey addressed the Sub-Committee in their capacity as Ward Councillors in objection to the application.

1 MEMBERSHIP

- 1.1 It was noted that Councillor James Spencer had replaced Councillor Melvyn Caplan and that Councillor Eoghain Murphy had replaced Councillor Louise Hyams.

2 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

- 2.1 The Chairmen explained that a week before the meeting, all six Members of the Sub-Committee were provided with a full set of papers including a detailed officer's report; together with bundles of the letters or e-mails received in respect of this application containing objections or giving support. If an issue or comment made by a correspondent was not specifically mentioned at this meeting in the officers' presentation or by Members of the Sub-Committee, it did not mean that the issue has been ignored.
- 2.2 Councillor Jim Glen declared that in respect of Item 1 he was a Trustee of the Westminster Tree Trust and advised that he had not discussed the Application with members.
- 2.3 Councillor Geoff Barraclough declared that, in respect of Item 1, he was a member of the Westminster Labour Group and advised that the Body had made submissions about the proposals and stated that he had not been involved in this process or discussed the application with colleagues.
- 2.4 Councillor Boothroyd declared that he was the Head of Research and Psephology for Thorncliffe, whose clients were companies applying for

planning permission from various local authorities. He advised that some Thorncliffe clients had engaged DP9 as planning consultants, who were separately representing the applicants at the Sub-Committee. However, he did not deal directly with clients or other members of project teams, and planning consultants were not themselves clients.

- 2.5 Councillor Boothroyd declared that he was a member of a Planning Applications Sub-Committee who met in March 2014 and which decided an application for various upgrade works in Victoria Tower Gardens.
- 2.6 Councillor Boothroyd further declared that he was a member of the Westminster Labour Group but had no input into its representation for Item 1.

3 PLANNING APPLICATIONS

1 THE VICTORIA TOWER GARDENS, MILLBANK, LONDON SW1P 3YB

Installation of the United Kingdom Holocaust Memorial and Learning Centre including excavation to provide a basement and basement mezzanine for the learning centre (Class D1); erection of a single storey entrance pavilion; re-provision of the Horseferry Playground and refreshments kiosk (Class A1); repositioning of the Spicer Memorial; new hard and soft landscaping and lighting around the site; and all ancillary and associated works.

Late representations were received from DP9 (10.02.20), Board of Deputies of British Jews dated (10.02.20), Save Victoria Tower Gardens & The Thorney Island Society (10.02.20), Cathedral Area Residents Group (07.02.20), Jeremy Barrell (11.02.20), Dr Irene Lancaster received (03.02.20), W.H. Fullerton (02.02.20), John Hesse-Architect (07.02.20), Mrs G P Hale (05.02.20), Gita Conn (10.02.20) and Ruth Hilton (03.02.20).

Ms Karen Pollock MBE, representing the Holocaust Educational Trust addressed the Sub-Committee in support of the Application.

Ms Mala Tribitch MBE, representing the Holocaust Educational Trust addressed the Sub-Committee in support of the Application.

Ms Lucy Tilley of Adjaye Associates (Architect) addressed the Sub-Committee in support of the Application.

Ms Barbara Dingle addressed the Sub-Committee in support of the Application.

Mr David Cooper, representing sponsors addressed the Sub-Committee in support of the Application.

Dr Stephen G Frankiss addressed the Sub-Committee in support of the Application.

Mr Alan Leibowitz representing Save Victoria Tower Gardens addressed the Sub-Committee in objection to the Application.

Ms Nina Grunfeld representing Save Victoria Tower Gardens addressed the Sub-Committee in objection to the Application.

Mr Jeremy Barrell addressed the Sub-Committee in objection to the Application.

Dr Louise Read addressed the Sub-Committee in objection to the Application.

Mr Nicholas Hales addressed the Sub-Committee in objection to the Application.

Mr Robert Lindsey addressed the Sub-Committee in objection to the Application.

Mr Robert Nagle addressed the Sub-Committee in objection to the Application.

Ms Trudy Gold on behalf of Baroness Ruth Deech addressed the Sub-Committee in objection to the Application.

Ms Sally Prothero representing London Parks and Gardens Trust (Planning and Conservation Group) addressed the Sub-Committee in objection to the Application.

Ms Clare Annamalai representing Thorney Island Society addressed the Sub-Committee in objection to the Application.

Ms Barbara Weiss representing Westminster Society addressed the Sub-Committee in objection to the Application.

Councillor Mark Shearer addressed the Sub-Committee in his capacity as Ward Councillor in objection to the Application.

Council David Harvey addressed the Sub-Committee in his capacity as Ward Councillor in objection to the Application.

RESOLVED UNANIMOUSLY:

A That had the application not been called in by the Secretary of State for Housing, Communities and Local Government, the Committee agreed that, although the principle of a national memorial and learning centre to the Holocaust was supported, the proposed memorial and learning centre, was, because of its size, design, location and associated activity, an inappropriate form of development for the following reasons:

i. Heritage:

Because of its location, size and design, the Holocaust Memorial and Learning Centre would cause harm, which was less than substantial, to the significance of Victoria Tower Gardens, the Westminster Abbey and Parliament Square Conservation Area, the setting and significance of Buxton Memorial, the neighbouring grade 1 listed Palace of Westminster, and the setting, significance and outstanding universal value of the Palace of Westminster and Westminster Abbey including Saint Margaret's Church World Heritage Site. This harm was

not considered to be outweighed by the public benefits of the proposed development.

Or, if the trees are lost or damaged:

Because of its location, size and design, the Holocaust Memorial and Learning Centre would cause substantial harm to the significance of Victoria Tower Gardens, the Westminster Abbey and Parliament Square Conservation Area, the setting and significance of Buxton Memorial, the neighbouring grade 1 listed Palace of Westminster, and the setting, significance and outstanding universal value of the Palace of Westminster and Westminster Abbey including Saint Margaret's Church World Heritage Site. This substantial harm was not outweighed by public benefits.

ii. Trees:

Inadequate and conflicting information had been submitted to allow proper assessment of the impact of the proposed development on trees within Victoria Tower Gardens, together with the effectiveness of suggested mitigation. As such it had not been satisfactorily demonstrated that unacceptable harm to, and/or loss of, trees would not arise as a result of the proposed development. Damage and/or loss to trees would be detrimental to the visual amenities of the area, and would have a further adverse effect on the significance of heritage assets.

iii. Open Space:

The proposed development and associated increased visitor activity would result in the loss of public open space and would harm the function of the Victoria Tower Gardens as an open space for active recreation and relaxation. This would be to the detriment of those who live in, work in, and visit the area.

B. That in the event that the Secretary of State granted permission following the inquiry, the Director of Place Shaping and Town Planning was authorised to seek to secure planning conditions (pursuant to s72 of the TCPA) and a s106/s278 legal agreement to secure the following:

- i. All highway works immediately surrounding the site required for the development to occur, including any necessary changes to foot way levels, on-street restrictions, (legal, administrative and physical);
- ii. Public realm improvements;
- iii. A financial contribution towards carbon offsetting;
- iv. Management Plan (including security, operational, pre-booking system for learning centre and free public access in perpetuity);

- v. A financial contribution towards the Westminster Employment Service;
- vi. A financial contribution of (sum to be confirmed) towards updating Legible London signage payable on commencement;
- vii. ss106 monitoring costs.

The Meeting ended at 9.05 pm

CHAIRMAN: _____

DATE _____